Original Article Tension-Free Vaginal Tape versus Transobturator Tape for Treatment of Female Stress Urinary Incontinence

El-Nashar A.M.¹, Metwally A.H.¹, Abdelwahab H.A¹ and Fawaz S.S²

¹Urology Department, Suez Canal University, Ismailia and ²Family Medicine Department, Ministry of Health, Cairo, Egypt

ABSTRACT

Objectives: The transobturator tape (TOT) is based on a similar principle as the tension-free vaginal tape (TVT), but introduced through the obturator foramen. The aim of this study was to compare these slings as surgical procedures for the treatment of stress urinary incontinence (SUI) in women.

Patients and Methods: This is a retrospective case-control study including female patients with SUI, either due to urethral hypermobility or intrinsic sphincter deficiency. Thirty patients were treated with TVT (group 1) and 30 were treated with TOT (group 2). The parameters studied were: pre-operative clinical data, operative data and surgical outcome.

Results: The post-operative complications in group 1 consisted of bladder perforation in one patient (3.3%), urinary retention in 3 (10%) and de novo urgency in 3 (10%). The post-operative complications in group 2 consisted of vaginal exposure in 2 patients (6.7%), de novo urgency in 2 (6.7%) and transient urinary retention in one (3.3%). In the TVT group, objective cure was achieved in 27/30 patients (90%), while 3 patients (10%) reported subjective cure; failure was not encountered. In the TOT group, objective cure was achieved in 24/30 patients (80%) and subjective cure in 4 patients (13.3%); and it failed in 2 patients (6.7%).

Conclusion: TVT and TOT are effective procedures for the treatment of female SUI, with comparable results regarding operative time, hospital stay and the risk of complications.

Key Words : Stress urinary incontinence, treatment and outcome

Corresponding Author: Dr. Ahmed El-Nashar, Urology Department, Suez Canal University, Ismailia, Egypt, Email: ahmedelnashar@gmail.com

Article Info: Date received : 9/4/2009

Date accepted (after revision): 27/12/2009

INTRODUCTION

Stress urinary incontinence (SUI) is distressing problem especially in the elderly as it has a great impact on the quality of life. Physically, urinary incontinence is associated with urinary tract infection, skin rashes and pressure sores. Psychologically, the patients often suffer from embarrassment, depression and isolation. Economically, the monetary costs of managing urinary incontinence in the USA have been estimated at about \$10.3 billion annually¹.

Urodynamic SUI, defined as the involuntary leakage of urine during increased abdominal pressure in the absence of a detrusor contraction, is diagnosed in more than half of women presenting to hospital with urinary incontinence².

The tension-free vaginal tape (TVT) procedure is one of the most popular modalities for treatment of SUI. A polypropylene tape is

inserted suburethrally under local anesthesia with sedation. The tape is thought to work by providing a pubourethral "neoligament." Increased intra-abdominal pressure results in a kink at the point of fixation, which prevents urine flow. Data from three early case studies suggested objective cure rates of 84-100%, with few complications³⁻⁵. Bladder perforation is the most frequent complication; the incidence is higher in patients who have undergone a previous retropubic procedure. Hematomas are generally uncommon. The complication of concern among all prosthetic slings is urethral erosion. Urinary tract infection may occur, and sterile urine is essential before surgery. Voiding dysfunction and dyspareunia have been reported, which in most cases resolve within 3 months of surgery⁶.

The transobturator tape (TOT) is based on a similar principle as the TVT but applies an innovative approach. Unlike the traditional TVT or sling that exits through the anterior abdominal wall, the TOT is introduced through the obturator foramen⁷. The TOT approach avoids almost all major structures in the pelvic cavity. The only potential area of concern is the one around the obturator vessels. However, the location of these vessels is on the opposite side of where the needles are placed. Therefore, with proper placement it is extremely unlikely that injury to these vessels will occur⁸.

The aim of this study was to compare TVT and TOT as surgical procedures for the treatment of SUI in women.

PATIENTS AND METHODS

It is a retrospective case-control study of female patients with SUI due to urethral hypermobility or intrinsic sphincter deficiency treated with either TVT (30 patients, group 1) or TOT (30 patients, group 2) in the Urology Department, Suez Canal University, from August 2006 to August 2007. The following parameters were studied:

- Pre-operative clinical data: Age, parity, complaint, previous operations, type of incontinence, results of urological, neurological, and gynecological examinations, stress test (cough provocation test) in supine and standing positions with a bladder volume of about 300 cc and Q-tip test to assess urethral hypermobility (>30° indicated urethral hypermobility, <30° no urethral hypermobility).
- Pre-operative investigations: Urine analysis, serum-creatinine, complete blood picture, and urodynamic studies.
- Operative data: Mean duration of operation, intra-operative complications, post-operative complications and hospital stay.
- Clinical outcome: Objective cure was defined as no leakage of urine while performing the cough provocation test with at least 300 ml of saline solution in the bladder. Subjective cure was defined as no urine loss during stress as reported by the patient. Failure was defined as urinary incontinence being still considered a social or hygienic problem.

The data at one year follow-up according to the patients' medical records were analyzed. The data analysis was based on estimating the percentage of discrete data. Statistical analysis was carried out using the appropriate statistical tests. P value <0.05 was considered statistically significant.

RESULTS

There were no significant differences in age, parity, history of pelvic surgery, or type of stress urinary incontinence among the studied patients (Table 1).

Mean operative time and hospital stay were significantly shorter in the TOT group (Table 2). There were no statistically significant differences regarding perioperative complications. Vaginal exposure in 2 patients

Table 1: Demographic data.

	Group 1	Group 2	p-value
Age (mean \pm SD, years)	52.6 ± 10.3	51.95 ± 10.7	0.81^{*}
Parity (mean \pm SD)	2.5 ± 1.1	2.05 ± 1.3	0.13*
	9(30)		
Previous pelvic surgery N (%):	6 (20)	12(40)	0.59°
Hysterectomy	3 (10)	9 (30)	
Anti-incontinence surgery	-	3 (10)	
Cystocele repair		3 (10)	
Type of SUI N (%)	18 (60)		
Pure SUI	12 (40)	15 (50)	0.61 °
Mixed SUI		15 (50)	
Uzethal huremetility N (9/).			
Urethral hypermobility N (%): Q-tip test >30 degrees	24(80)	24(80)	0.75°
Q-tip test< 30 degrees	6 (20)	6 (20)	0.75
VLPP N (%):	0 (20)	0 (20)	
< 60 cm H ₂ O	6 (20)	6 (20)	0.75°
	0 (20)	0 (20)	0.75

* t-test c Chi-square test

Table 2: Operative data and perioperative complications.

	Group 1	Group 2	p-value
Operative time (mean \pm SD, minutes)	26.3 ± 6.46	12.3 ± 2.6	< 0.0001*
Hospital stay (mean \pm SD, hours)	31.2 ± 5.7	6 ± 0.6	$< 0.0001^{*}$
Major postoperative complications N (%)			
Bladder perforation	1 (3.3)	0	1 ^f
Vaginal exposure	0	2 (6.7)	0.49 ^f
Minor postoperative complications N (%)			
De novo urgency	3 (10)	2 (6.7)	1 ^f
Urinary retention <week< td=""><td>3 (10)</td><td>1 (3.3)</td><td>0.61^f</td></week<>	3 (10)	1 (3.3)	0.61 ^f

* t-test f Fisher's exact test

Table 3: Surgical outcome at one year follow-up.

	Group 1	Group 2	p-value
Objective cure N(%)	27 (90)	24 (80)	0.31 °
Subjective cure N (%)	3 (10)	4 (13.3)	
Failure N(%)	0 (0)	2 (6.7)	

c Chi-square

in the TOT group was managed with removal of the exposed tape and placement of a new tape. Both patients were continent postoperatively. Postoperative urinary retention in 4 patients resolved after urethral dilatation and the use of intermittent urethral catheterization until no significant post-void residual urine was seen. De novo urgency was treated with anticholinergic drugs.

VLPP - Valsalva leak point pressure

Objective and subjective cure and failure rates are shown in Table 3. There were no statistically significant differences between the groups (Table 3).

DISCUSSION

SUI is a significant problem affecting 20% of women above 45 years of age9. In our study the mean operative time in the TVT group was 26.3 minutes and mean hospital stay was 31.2 hours. These results are comparable to those reported by Kim et al. (mean operative time 23.4 minutes, mean hospital stay 1.8 days)¹⁰. The mean operative time in the TOT group was 12.3 ± 2.6 minutes, and mean hospital stay was 6 ± 0.6 hours. In a study by Sivanesan et al.11 the mean operative time for TOT was 14.7 minutes and nearly 80% of patients were discharged on the day of surgery. The remaining patients were hospitalized because of unsatisfactory voiding or post-operative symptoms of vomiting or pain, but none of the patients had complete urinary retention.

In our study the mean operative time and hospital stay were significantly shorter in the TOT compared with the TVT group. This confirms the results of Falkert and Seelbach-Göbel¹² who found that the mean operative time and hospital stay were significantly less in TOT compared with TVT.

The post-operative complications in our TVT group were favorably comparable to those of Abouassaly et al. who conducted a multi-institutional review of patients subjected to a TVT procedure and encountered a larger number of early and late complications which also included blood loss >500 ml, pelvic pain and intravaginal tape erosion¹³. These complications were not encountered in our study.

Post-operative complications were encountered in 5 patients in the TOT group, two had vaginal exposure and three had voiding dysfunction. In both patients with vaginal exposure removal of the exposed tape and placement of a new one was performed. A comparative study carried out by Yamada et al. demonstrated a significantly higher extrusion rate using the ObTapeTM sling vs the MonarcTM sling (13.4% vs 0%, p = 0.004)¹⁴. Microstructural differences in the synthetic sling material may account for differences in extrusion rates. Barry et al. conducted a prospective study involving 83 women with urodynamic stress incontinence who underwent insertion of the Monarc transobturator tape. Post-operatively, four women (4.8%) had objective voiding dysfunction, but the authors concluded that this value was not statistically significant compared to the pre-operative values¹⁵.

Falkert and Seelbach-Göbel reported in their comparative study between TVT and TOT that there were no major peri-operative complications in either group, although complicated intra-operative hemorrhage (hemoglobin decrease >1.5 g/dl) was slightly commoner in the TVT group. Urinary retention (defined as post-void residual volume >100 ml) occurred in 23% of the TVT group and in 2% of the TOT group. Urinary infections were also more frequent in the TVT group¹².

Although not encountered in our study, cases of bladder perforation, adductor muscle abscess formation, urethral injury and erosion, post-operative urinary retention, and bladder erosion have been reported^{16,17}.

The objective cure rate in our TVT group was similar to that reported by Paick et al. (95.8% at a mean follow-up of 10.9 months)¹⁸. Less favorable cure rates were reported by Nilsson et al., probably due to the much longer follow-up period of 7 years (objective and subjective cure rates of 81% at a mean follow-up of 91 months)¹⁹. The objective cure rate in our TOT group is comparable to the results reported by Delorme et al. (cure rate 90.6%, improvement 9.4%)²⁰.

In our study there was no statistically significant difference in surgical outcomes between the TOT and TVT groups. The same result was reported by Dietz et al.²¹.

In conclusion; both TVT and TOT are effective procedures for the treatment of

female SUI, and were comparable regarding the operative time, hospital stay, and the risk of complications related to the different path of the tape.

REFERENCES

- Consensus conference. Urinary incontinence in adults. JAMA. 1989; May 12;261(18):2685-90.
- AbramsP,CardozoL,FallM,GriffithsD,RosierP,Ulmsten U, et al. The standardisation of terminology of lower urinary tract function: Report from the Standardisation Sub-committee of the International Continence Society. Neurourol.Urodyn. 2002;21(2):167-78.
- Ulmsten U, Henriksson L, Johnson P, Varhos G. An ambulatory surgical procedure under local anesthesia for treatment of female urinary incontinence. Int.Urogynecol.J.Pelvic Floor Dysfunct. 1996;7(2):81,5; discussion 85-6.
- Nilsson CG. The Tension-free Vaginal Tape procedure (TVT) for treatment of female urinary incontinence. A minimal invasive surgical procedure. Acta Obstet.Gynecol.Scand.Suppl. 1998;168:34-7.
- Ulmsten U, Falconer C, Johnson P, Jomaa M, Lanner L, Nilsson CG, et al. A multicenter study of Tension-free Vaginal Tape (TVT) for surgical treatment of stress urinary incontinence. Int. Urogynecol.J.Pelvic Floor Dysfunct. 1998;9(4):210-3.
- Boustead GB. The tension-free vaginal tape for treating female stress urinary incontinence. BJU Int. 2002; May;89(7):687-93.
- Pelosi III MA. Location of the obturator artery as it traverses the obturator foramen in relation to the transobturatorsling'ssafeentryzone:Clinicalimplications. J.Am.Assoc.Gynecol.Laparosc. 2004;11:S4.
- Costa P, Grise P, Droupy S, Monneins F, Assenmacher C, Ballanger P, et al. Surgical treatment of female stress urinary incontinence with a Trans-Obturator-Tape (T.O.T.) Uratape: Short term results of a prospective multicentric study. Eur.Urol. 2004; Jul;46(1):102,6; discussion 106-7.
- Thomas TM, Plymat KR, Blannin J, Meade TW. Prevalence of urinary incontinence. Br.Med.J. 1980; Nov 8;281(6250):1243-5.

- Kim JY, Jeong HS, Lee YT, Cha SH, Kim HC, Kang SH, et al. Comparative study of tension-free vaginal tape and burch colposuspension in the surgical management of female stress urinary incontinence. Korean J.Obstet.Gynecol. 2004;47(2):264-8.
- Sivanesan K, Fattah MA, Ramsay I. Transobturator tape as a day surgery procedure: A case control study. Int.J.Surg. 2007;5(3):152-4.
- Falkert A, Seelbach Göbel B. TVT versus TOT for surgical treatment of female stress urinary incontinence. Int.J.Gynecol.Obstet. 2007;96(1):40-1.
- Abouassaly R, Steinberg JR, Lemieux M, Marois C, Gilchrist LI, Bourque JL, et al. Complications of tension-free vaginal tape surgery: A multiinstitutional review. BJU Int. 2004; Jul;94(1):110-3.
- Yamada BS, Govier FE, Stefanovic KB, Kobashi KC. High rate of vaginal erosions associated with the mentor ObTape. J.Urol. 2006; Aug;176(2):651,4; discussion 654.
- Barry C, Naidu A, Lim Y, Corsitaans A, Muller R, Rane A. Does the Monarc transobturator suburethral sling cause post-operative voiding dysfunction? A prospective study. Int.Urogynecol.J.Pelvic Floor Dysfunct. 2006; Jan;17(1):30-4.
- Game X, Mouzin M, Vaessen C, Malavaud B, Sarramon JP, Rischmann P. Obturator infected hematoma and urethral erosion following transobturator tape implantation. J.Urol. 2004; Apr;171(4):1629.
- Parekh MH, Minassian VA, Poplawsky D. Bilateral bladder erosion of a transobturator tape mesh. Obstet.Gynecol. 2006; Sep;108(3 Pt 2):713-5.
- Paick JS, Oh SJ, Kim SW, Ku JH. Tensionfree vaginal tape, suprapubic arc sling and transobturator tape in the treatment of mixed urinary incontinence in women. Int.Urogynecol.J.Pelvic Floor Dysfunction. 2008;19(1):123-9.
- Nilsson CG, Falconer C, Rezapour M. Sevenyear follow-up of the tension-free vaginal tape procedure for treatment of urinary incontinence. Obstet.Gynecol. 2004;104(6):1259-62.
- Delorme E, Droupy S, de Tayrac R, Delmas V. Transobturator tape (Uratape): A new minimallyinvasive procedure to treat female urinary incontinence. Eur.Urol. 2004; Feb;45(2):203-7.
- Dietz HP, Barry C, Lim Y, Rane A. TVT vs Monarc: A comparative study. Int.Urogynecol.J.Pelvic Floor Dysfunct. 2006; Nov;17(6):566-9.